pt I

1951. **File No.** Dcs 1051

A CLASS P.W. **DEPARTMENT**

F. **BRANCH**

Subject:— Diploma Courses

Bombay Engineering Services

Recognition of the institution &

Certificates granted by them, for the

Purpose of recruitment to.

A [K] 1952

File No. Dcs 1051

pt I.

F-Br

Etd. Scott. Blip. 24 A

Std. Sectt. 78A a.

G.R., G D., No 2408, dated 22-6-22.]

Correspondence

DOCKET SHEET (B)

pt I

Subject :—

File No. ~~D.C.S.~~ DCS 1051

P. W. **DEPT.**

F **BRANCH.**

References :—

Copies from the original file A[c]

Date.	To whom sent.	Notes and instructions.

Government Service.
Recongnition of Degrees in Civil Mechanical and Electrical Engineering of the University of Roorkee for purposes of the ---

GOVERNMENT OF BOMBAY,
POLITICAL AND SERVICES DEPARTMENT.
Resolution No. 206/46.
Bombay Castle, 30th April 1951,

Endorsement from the Government of India, Ministry of Education, No. F. 17-18/49-T-2, dated the 31st October 1950.

RESOLUTION:- The Government of Bombay is pleased to recognise in consultation with the State Public Service Commission, the degrees in Civil, Mechanical and Electrical Engineering of the University of Roorkee as equivalent to the corresponding degrees of the Bombay University for purposes of recruitment to services under it.

By order of the Governor of Bombay,

S.G.DESAI,
for Chief Secretary to the Government of Bombay,
Political and Services Department

k POL. & S.H·12

To

The Secret-ary to the Gover-nor,
The Secretary to the Honourable the Chief Minister,
The Accountant General, Bombay,
The Secretary to the Bombay Public Service Commission,
The Prothonotary and Senior Master, High Court Bombay (by letter),
The Regist-rar, High Court, Appellate Side, Bombay (By letter),
The Joint Director of Technical Education, Bombay.
The Director of Publicity (for issue of a Press note).
All other Heads of Departments and Offices under the several Departments of the Secretariat,
The Education Department,
The Public Works Department.
All Other Departments of the Secretariat.

No. of 1951,

Copy forwarded for information and guidance to

1951. **File No.** CME 2351

A G P.W. **DEPARTMENT**

F **BRANCH**

Subject:— Committee.

Appointed by Govt. to examine the problem of ~~Re~~ recruitment to administrative services under Govt., on the basis of qualifications attained by passing University Examination etc.

A[K] 1951

File No. CME 2351- F. Be.

Ed. Scott. Slip. 91 A

Std. Sectt. 78 e.

G.R., G. D., No. 2408, dated 22-6-22.]

Correspondence

DOCKET SHEET

Subject :—

File No. CME 2351.

P. W. DEPT.

F. BRANCH.

References :— Seperated from main file. ACM) 1951.

8 Copies " " " "

Date.	To whom sent.	Notes and instructions.

Report of the Committee appointed by the Government of Bombay to examine the Problem of Recruitment of to Administrative Services under Government on the basis of the qualifications attained by passing University Examinations, etc.

Appointment of the Committee.

The Committee was appointed by Government Resolution No. 9195, Education Department, of 13th January 1950.

RESOLUTION OF GOVERNMENT.

A long standing complaint against our Educational system is that the passing of University examinations is looked upon mainly as a stepping stone to Government employment. In their recommendations for the correction of evils now existing in the Examinatinn system, pending the development of objective tests, the University Educatione Commission have observed inter alia as follows:--

"A University degree should not be required for Government administrative services. Special State examinations for recruitmen to the various services should be organised and should be open to whosoever cares to take them. That this may not unduly add to the work of the Service Commissions, a small deposit may be prescribed for the privilege of taking of the examination, and candidates satisfying a certain minimum standard of achievement may be entitled to a refund. This would remove onee of the chief evils of the Educational system."

2. The Government of Bombay has had for some time past this important question under its consideration. The recommendation of the University Education Commission involves the remodelling of the entire machinery of administrative selection. Governmment is accordingly pleased to appoint an informal Committee under the Chairmanship of the Chief Secretary to the Government of Bombay, consisting of the following members, to examine the problem and make recommendations in the matter to Government:-

1) Shri Y.A.Godbole,I.C.S.(Retired),J.P.Chairman Bombay Public Service Commission
2) Professor A.R.Wadia,Bar-at-Law,Pro-Vice-Chancellor. Maharaja Sayajirao University of Baroda.
3) Professor D.G.Karve,M.A.Executive Editor,Bombay District Gazetters (Revision).

4) The Educational Adviser to the Government of Bombay.

5. The Secretary to the Government of Bombay, Education Deptt.

Shri L.M.A.Menezes, Under Secretary to the Government of Bombay, Education Department, will act as an Secretary to the Committee.

3. The Committee should be requested to submit its report as early as possible.

Prodedure.

4. Two meetings were held, The first was held on the 8th February 1950, at which the Chief Sedretary, the Secretary, Education Department, The Educational Adviser, Professor Karve, Professor Wadia and Shri Menezes were present, Shri Godbole being unable to attend owing to indisposition. The second meeting was held on 14th March 1950, and was attended by all the members and by the Secretary to the Committee.

5. At the same time, steps were taken to collect information regarding the qualifications required for recruitment to posts under Government, from the various Departments of the Secretariat.

6. The Chairman, Public Service Commission, prepared a comprehensive Note, which was considered at the second meeting of the Committee.

The Problem Stated.

7. It has long been a charge against our system of higher education that the passing of the University examinations is looked upon, by those who pass them, mainly as a stepping stone to Government employment. A University degree has become, in practice if not in the theory, a minimum qualification for all but the lowest administrative jobs in Government service. This association of a University degree with Government employment has, it is alleged, been respondible for attracting to the University large numbers of unsuitable or uninterested students, which, in turn, has had a disastrous effect upon University standards and resulted in the devaluation of degree. One of the consequences of this attitude to higher studies has been that a large proportion of the students entering the University do not complete the course, with consequent drift and wastage of precious human meterial.

8...

8. The University Education Commission has, in its Report, drawn attention to this problem in an emphatic manner. The chief purpose of the present examinations, it observes, is not organically related to the actual process of education, Examinations have become a mere passport for jobs. The insistence on a University degree as the minimum requirement even for posts of minor officials and clerks has made techning even for posts of minor officials and clerks has made teaching subservient to the examination and rendered it almost impossible to provide true education and develop the wider interests that should go with higher learning. The Commission ~~interests that should go with higher learning.~~ The Commission interests that should go with higher learning The Commission has suggested various means of remedying this state of affairs,

The first of these remedies is the dissociation of University degrees from Government employment and the setting up, for recruitment to the various services, "of special State Examinations which should be open to whoseever cares to take them."

The Problem Analysed.

9. As the criticism is directed towards the mode of recruitment to public services, it is desirable that the principles governing such recruitment be porperly appreciated. Recruitment to public services, unlike recruitment by a private employer, must be so arranged as to give a fair change to selection to every citizen possessing the requisite qualifications and wishing to compete. It is not sufficient that the man selected for the job can more than adequately di-scharge duties of the post to which he is appointed, the appointment should be made in such a manner that there are no reasonable grounds for allegations of favouritism. This involves a public advertisement inviting applications, receipt of applications from candidates seeking the appointment and a selection from among the candidates who apply. The prescription of minimum qualifications serves as a rough and ready test for preliminary elimination. There are some very sound reasons why University degrees are frequently prescribed to secure this purpose.

Firstly, the possession of a University degree is expected to indicate a certain standard of mental and cultural development which would not be out of place in any walk of life. Even with the prescription of the minimum qualifications, the number of candidates competing for appointment is generally large; and many of them hold University degrees much higher than the minimum prescribed. In this context, the prescription of a University degree only facilitates the task of final selection. Secondly, as regards recruitment to professional and technical posts, University degrees constitute the best evidence of skill needed for the job in the absence of well organised professional or technical guilds which make it a point to examine pupils and issue certificates of proficiancy. Thirdly, a candidate for appointment is usually required tobe at least 18 years old. With regard to thee large majority of superior posts, the minimum age limit is 21 or more. A person intnedding to enter Government service must keep himself occupied till he is qualified by age to secure an appointment, and, so far, there has been harldy any course open to him, except to join a college to occupy the critical years between school-leaving and employment.

10. We are of the view that in order to secure the best material available, recruitment to public services must be made on the result of tests of a competitive character. The only exception should be appointment made by promotion and certain posts of a special or technical character--which should be very few indeed. We are, however, of the opinion that the recommendation of the University Education Commission that a University degree should not be required for Government administrative service is based on an over-simplification of the problem. A qualification based on University education cannot be altogether dispensed with in respect of recruitment to posts for which the educational and cultural background guaranteed by University education is an asset. But we agree that the qualifications at present prescribed for the purspse are in many cases pegged at unduly high legels and recommend that the Political and Services Deptt.

Department should review the qualifications in consultation with the administrative Departments concerned and, where necessary, with Public Service Commission, with a view to lowering them. It should be possible to lower the qualifications prescribed by one or two stages in an appreciable number of cases-- that is, where now a degree is required it should be sufficient to prescribe either the Intermediate or the Secondary School Certificate Examination and where the Intermediate Examination is now prescribed, it should be sufficient to prescribe the Secondary School Certificate Examination.

11. A mere lowering of the minimum qualifications will not by itself achieve the object in view, because the method of selection usually adopted by the selecting authorities tends to favour persons with University education. Thus, if the competitive tests are merely reproductions of the present University examinations, persons intending to join Government service will still flock to the Universities, notwithstanding that the minimum qualification for appearing at the public service competition does not require a university degree. It is, therefore, necessary that the method of recruitment should be so formulated as not to give undue advantage to persons with University education.

12. We are aware of the criticism that is levelled against the ordinary written essay type of examination. But in our view, such tests, with certain modifications which we are going to suggest, are still the most reliable means available. One alternative that is suggested is the objective test. The University Education Commission has recommended that adoption of these tests in respect of University examinations. But, even that Commission recognises that a thorough study of the scientific methods of testing and appraising is necessary, and that texts would have to be developed de novo for our use. Another method of selection, viz., the interview, is by its very nature, capable of being used only where the field from which the selections is to be made is comparatively small. It can, therefore, be used only as a supplement to the written essay type of examination, except in regard to recruitment to specialised

posts where the field of selection is likely tobe small.

13. We, therefore, recommend that the ordinary essay type of examination should contunue to be adppted for purposes of making selection to public services. With a view to making these examinations as valid and reliable and objective as possible, we suggest that the tests shouldbe functional: i.e. the group of groups of subjects to be prescribed for a particular text should have a definite relation to the duties of the post which the candidate will be expected to fill; though it may happen, in a particular subject or subjects, that the syllabus and standard correspond to the syllabus and standard of a particular University examination. In addition, intelligence and attainment tests as also the interview should be used in conjunction with written tests. The exact weightage to be given to objective tests or the interview vis-a-vis the results of the written tests in any scheme of recruitment, should be decided by the recuirements of each tupe of employment in the light of experience.

14. We recommend that the selecting authority should take into account the recod of a candidate's progress in a school or college, while making selection, Such records would be of great value, provided they are maintained regularly and impartially. Conditions vary widely ifrom one educational Institution to another and some of us have doubts whether these records would, in fact, be properly maintained. We are, however, of the opinion that schools and colleges should be encouraged to maintain such records carefully and systematically and selecting authorities should take them into consideration,

The value to be given to the record in any individual case must be left to be decided hy the selecting authority having due regard to the reliability of the Records.

15. The competitive character of the recruitment tests with the lowering of the eligibility in some cases is bound to attract large numbers of candidates. This is likely to create a problem for the Public Service Commission or any other selecting authority. The problem must be faced and the necessary administrative arrangements should be made. It

It may be possible to group together a number of services or posts for purposes of recruitment and hold a single competitive test the optional subjects being adjusted in accordance with the requirements of individual services. Where the number of candidates is very large, decentralisation of the examination and the holding of the tests at different centres simultaneously may be necessary. We have considered the recommendation of the University Education Commission that, in order to keep down the number of candidates a small deposit may be prescribed for the privilege of taking the examination and candidates satisfying a certain minimum standard of achievement may be entitled to a refund. Experience shows that the prescription of a heavy fee, unless, indeed it is so large as even to deter meritorious candidates with small means, is not likely to reduce appreciably the number of candidatges, as largr fees are too often gambled away by desperate hopefuls in the lottery of employment. Moreover, the receipt and later refunds of deposits will create a complex administrative problem of its own which is likely to more than offset any advantages that may be gained by a small reduction in numbers. We do not, therefore, favour the taking of such a deposit. A reasonable fee should, of course, be charged to cover the expenses of the examination, but these fees should not be turned into a source of revenue to Government.

SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS.

1. Recruitment to public services should be made through tests which should be competitive in character, so as to secure the best personnel available.

2. Candidates appearing at these tests should possess certain prescribed minimum academic qualifications to be elegible to appear for any particular test. This condition for elegibility will vary with each test. In the case of technical posts a technical degree or diploma will have to be such a condition. Gengrally speaking, the present minimum qualification for a large number of administrative posts call for a downward revision.

A university degree need not be insisted upon except in cases where it may be absolutely necessary.

3. Competitive tests should be of specialised or functional types and they should not merely reproduce the syllabus or standards of University examinations.

4. Intelligence and attainment tests may be used in conjunction with other tupes of tests, for a complete assessment of a candidate.

5. School and college records, where available, should be used in assessing a candidate, but with circumspection.

6. A reasonable fee should be charged to the candidates appearing at the tests in order to meet the expenditure on the recruitment machinery; but no refundable deposit should be taken.

BOMBAY, PRINTED AT THE GOVERNMENT CENTRAL PRESS.

9

Report of the Committee appointed by Government to examine the problem of recruitment to administrative Services under Government on the basis of qualifications attained by passing University Examinations etc.

GOVERNMENT OF BOMBAY,
Political and Services Department,
Circular Memorandum No. 8839/46.
Bombay Castle, 10th July 1951.

CIRCULAR MEMORANDUM.

Copies of the Report mentioned above are forwarded herewith to all Departments of the Secretariat and the Heads of Departments under them for their information. Government has carefully considered the various recommendations embodied in the report and has decided that all of them should be accepted and should be implemented as far as quickly as possible. The question of holding competitive examinations for recruiting candidates to the various services and posts under this Government is being considered in consultation with the Bombay Public Service Commission. In the meantime the attention of all Departments of the Secretariat is particularly invited to recommendation (2) and they are requested to review in consultation with the Heads of Departments under them the educational qualifications prescribed for appointment to the various services and posts so far as they are respectively concerned and to submit proposals to the Political and Services Department for lowering them in accordance with the recommendation. The Bombay Public Services Commission should be consulted in the matter so far as posts and services lying within its purview are concerned after the proposals are approved by the Political and Services Department.

The attention of the Education Department is particularly invited to recommendation (6) embodied in the report and it is requested to consider, in consultation with the Political and Services Department, how far it is feasible to impliment it. It should then take necessary action for implementing this recommendation as far as possible on the lines to be settled

settled in consultationwith the Political and Services Department.

By order of the Governor of Bombay,

M.D.Bhat.

Chief Secretary to the Government of Bombay,
Political and Services Department,

To

The Secretary to the Governor,

The Accountant, General,Bombay.

The prothonotary and Senior Master, High Court, Bombay,
(By Letter)
The Registrar, High Court, Appellate Side, High Court, Bpmbay,
(By letter),
All other Heads of Departments under the several Departments of the Secretariat.
All Departments of the Secretariat.

Copy forwarded with compliments to the Secretary,

Bombay Public Services Commission.

Letter.

No.CME 2351 F.

Public Works Department,
Bombay Castle, (Bombay No.1.)
2nd August 1951.

To

The Chief Engineer, Bombay Electric Grid.
The Superintending Engineers of Circles,
The Electrical Engineer to Government.
The Public Health Engineer to Government,
The Architect to Government,
The Director, Development Department Chawls.

Subject:- Report of the Committee appointed by Government to examine the problem of recruitment to administrative Services under Government on the basis of qualifications attained by passing University Examinations etc.

.....

Reference:- Government Circular Memorandum, Political and Services Department, No. 8839/46, dated the 10th July 1951 ;

2. The attention of the local officers is invited to recommendation (2) of the Committee's report forwarded with the Government Circular Memorandum referred to above, and they are requested to review the educational qualifications prescribed for appointment to the various posts in Government Service and submit their proposals to this Department at an early date.

Issued/-
6-8-51.

By order of the Governor of Bombay,
Sd/-3-8-51.
Assistant Secretary to the Government of Bombay
Public Works Department,

D.A.:- Nil.

9840 47 17 13

No.G.99/ ~~9837~~ of 1951. Office of the Supdtg. Engineer,
Gujarat Irrigation Circle,
Baroda, 10th August 1951.

The Assistant Secretary to Government,
Public Works Department,
Bombay.

Sub:-- Report of the Committee appointed by Government to examine the problem of recruitment to administrative services under Government on the basis of qualifications attained by passing University examination etc.

13

Ref:-- Government Letter, P.W.D.No. CME.2351-F dt. 2-8-51.

Please arrange to send a copy of Government Circular Memorandum, Political and Services Department, No. 8839/46, dated the 10th July 1951 for reference of this office as the same is not received in this office.

Superintending Engineer,
G.I.C.,Baroda.

R.10/8.

Comp:by:

15

No.Y 7373 of 1951.
Office of the Superintending Engineer,
South Gujarat Circle, P. W. D., Baroda,
Dated, the, 13 August, 1951.

To

The Assistant Secretary,
Political & Services Department,
Bombay, 1.

Subject:- Report of the Committee appointed by Govt. to Exam. the problem of recruitment to administrative services under Govt. on the basis of qualification attained by passing University Examinations etc.

---

94 7-8

A copy of G.C.M., P.& S.Deptt.No.8839/46 dated 10-7-51 may please be sent early as it does not appear to have been received by this office and the same is now required for the disposal of Government call.

Superintending Engineer,
South Gujarat Circle. 13/8

Copy f.w.cs.to the Chief Engineer to Govt.P.W.D., Bombay, for information with reference to G.L.P.W.D.No.C.M.E.2351-F dated 2-8-51.

MAS.11/8

tD

F 17/8

17/3

CME2351

71367

F

17-8-51

No.G.99/13422 of 1951. Public Works Department,
Ahmedabad, 18 Oct.,51.

To

The Chief Engineer to Government,
Public Works Department,
BOMBAY...1.

Subject:- REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE APPOINTED BY GOVERNMENT TO EXAMINE THE PROBLEM OF RECRUITMENT TO ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES UNDER GOVERNMENT ON THE BASIS OF QUALIFICATIONS ATTAINED BY PASSING UNIVERSITY EXAMINATIONS ETC.

Reference:- Government Letter, Public Works Department, No.CME 2351 F, dated 2.8.51.

2. In Public Works Department majority of posts are technical ones and it does not seem necessary to make any change in the qualifications already prescribed for them. It is, however, suggested that since the Arch (2 Years certificate) course of the K.B.Technical Institute, Baroda, has been recently recognised for the purpose of recruitment to a ~~Divisional's~~ Draftsman's post as per Government Resolution, Political and Services Department No.266/46, dated 4.6.51, the Diploma of Arch (4 years certificate) course of the said institute may also be recognised for the purpose of recruitment to a Draftsman's post.

If Matriculation certificate or S.S.C. is prescribed as the minimum qualification for the posts of clerks and no higher starting pay is allowed to graduates, the unnecessary rush for higher qualification viz., B.A. degree for the purpose of getting a better start in clerical grade would be checked to some extent.

V. C. Bulsara
Superintending Engineer,
North Gujarat Circle.

J/17.10.
Compared by:-
17/10

52 ½ pt 2

CME 2351 | 90139

F.D 81

R.&D 13-1-52

similar reports from the remaining local officers may be awaited till the 10-11-51.

Dy 27-10-51.

R. 24/10/51.

A.M. (10 ½ ' ').

2.1.0

V. ins. p 28/11.

⊗ J.55 S.E. & I C.
" S & C.
" B C
" C C.
" H I C.

J.52 & Engr. Gr.
& El. Engr. & Asst Architect-Gr. & Dir. & D. Electr.

S.A.S.

fl. 2.10

F 20/10

F. W. H.
CME-2351
90139
F
19-10-51

5-5-5 19

No.Ec/G/99/11605 of 1951. Office of the Supdtg.Engineer,
Gujarat Irrigation Circle,
Baroda, 19th Novr. 1951.

The Chief Engineer to Government,
Public Works Department,
Bombay.

Sub:-- Report of the Committee appointed by Government to examine the problem of recruitment to administrative services under Government on the basis of qualifications attained by passing University Examinations etc.

Ref:-- Government Letter, P.W.D.No. CME 2351 dated 2-8-51 and No. PWD CNE-2351/13666-D dated 29-9-51.

Proposals as asked for vide G.C.M., Political & Services Department No. 8839/46 dated 10-7-51, I have to state as under :--

Minimum educational qualifications prescribed for appointment to clerical posts (junior clerks and senior clerks) are a Matriculation Certificate, S.S.L.C. or S.S.C. or any other equivalent examinations of a Recognised University. These qualifications are so low that downward revision is not possible. A University degree is not insisted upon while making appointments to these posts.

R.19/11.Comp:by:R.A

Superintending Engineer, G.I.C.,
Baroda.

20

CME 2351/100537

F.B.

55 46

R.M.P

S.E. S.B.,
" B.C.
" C.C.
" W.I.
20 Engr.
Brigade

similar reports from the remaining local officers may be circulated.

26-11-31.

26/11/31

S.A.S

P

Dir 26/11

F 21/11

21/11

I. W. D.
File No. CME 2351
Serial No. 100537

F

4-Engr

125 47 21 V

No. 8839/46-D,
Political and Services Department,
Bombay Castle, 22nd Nov. 1951.

Subject:- Report of the Committee appointed by the Government of Bombay to examine the problem of recruitment to administrative services under Government on the basis of the qualifications attained by passing University Examinations, etc.

MEMORANDUM,

The attention of all Departments of the Secretariat (except the Legal Department and Revenue Department) is invited to this Department Circular Memorandum, No. 8839/46, dated the 10th July 1951, on the subject mentioned above and they are requested to submit their proposals to this Department as early as possible.

Sd/-
For Assistant Secretary tothe Government of Bombay,
Political and Services Department.

15—49 23

Letter.

No. CME 2351 F.

Public Works Department,
B.C. (Bombay No.1.0.
11th Dec. 195.

To

The Assistant Secretary to the Government of Bombay,
Political and Services Department.

Subject:- Report of the Committee appointed by the Government of Bombay to examine the problem of recruitment to administrative services under Government on the basis of qualifications attained by passing University Examinations, etc ...

Reference:- Government Memo. P. & S.D.,

No. 8839/46--D, dated the 22-11-1951.

2. Information is still awaited from some of the local officers who have been expedited in the matter. Necy. proposal for lowering the educational qualifications prescribed for apptts. to the various posts will be submitted to the P. & S.D. on receipt of information from the officers concerned.

By order etc.,

S.A.S.

D.A.:- Nil.

Copy forwarded to:--

The S.E.,S.G.C.,

The S.E.,E.C.

The S.E.,C.C.,

TheS.E.,K.I.C..

The El, Engr/ to Government.

The Architect to Government.

The Dir. D.D.Chawls,

with a request to submit urgently the proposals called for in G.L.No. CME 2351-F. dated the 2-8-1951.

Id/-
5-12-51.